

RESOLUTION 03-07-2007

DIGEST

Prostitution: Legalization

Deletes Penal Code sections 647(b), 647f, 315, 316, 266(h), 653.20, 653.22, 653.23, and 653.24, amends Penal Code sections 647.1, 318, 266(i) and 11225, and adds Health and Safety Code section 429.13, to decriminalize prostitution and foster safer sex practices.

RESOLUTIONS COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE IN PRINCIPLE

History:

No similar resolutions found.

Reasons:

This resolution deletes Penal Code sections 647(b), 647f, 315, 316, 266(h), 653.20, 653.22, 653.23, and 653.24, amends Penal Code sections 647.1, 318, 266(i) and 11225, and adds Health and Safety Code section 429.13 to decriminalize prostitution and foster safer sex practices. This resolution should be approved in principle because of the public health and safety benefits to those engaged in prostitution, their clients, and the public.

Efforts to legislate “lifestyle” have a history of failure. For example, Prohibition was just such a failure. (U.S. Const., amend. XVIII (1919), repealed, amend. XXI (1933).) Instead, the subject behavior continues, though underground and therefore unregulated.

Decriminalizing prostitution and establishing regulations for safer sex practices of those engaged in prostitution will have a positive impact on public health. A 1993 study found no reported cases of prostitution-related HIV/AIDS in Nevada, where brothels may be licensed in certain counties. (Albert, Warner, et. al., *Condom Use among Female Commercial Sex Workers in Nevada’s Legal Brothels*, Am. J. Pub. Health (Nov. 1995), 85(11):1514-1520.)

Regulation of prostitution would also reduce violence and other associated criminal behavior. Because illegal prostitution occurs underground and without regulation, prostitutes are at increased risk of violent attacks from both customers and those who engage in other criminal activities generally associated with illegal prostitution. Decriminalization will separate sexual behavior from these and other illegal activities.

Legitimizing prostitution will allow those involved to benefit from labor rights available in other industries. Moreover, revenue generated for the state will offset costs associated with health and licensing issues. This resolution will keep intact all of the laws which prohibit forced prostitution as well as protection of children from same.

TEXT OF RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the Conference of Delegates recommends that legislation be sponsored to repeal Penal Code Sections 647(b), 647f, 315, 316, 266(h), 653.20, 653.22, 653.23, 653.24; to amend Penal Code Sections 647.1, 318, 266i, and 11225; and to add Health and Safety Code Section 429.13; to read as follows:

1 §647

2 Every person who commits any of the following acts is guilty of disorderly conduct,
3 a misdemeanor:

4 (a) Who solicits anyone to engage in or who engages in lewd or dissolute conduct in
5 any public place or in any place open to the public or exposed to public view.

6 ~~(b) Who solicits or who agrees to engage in or who engages in any act of~~
7 ~~prostitution. A person agrees to engage in an act of prostitution when, with specific intent to~~
8 ~~so engage, he or she manifests an acceptance of an offer or solicitation to so engage,~~
9 ~~regardless of whether the offer or solicitation was made by a person who also possessed the~~
10 ~~specific intent to engage in prostitution. No agreement to engage in an act of prostitution~~
11 ~~shall constitute a violation of this subdivision unless some act, in addition to the agreement,~~
12 ~~is done within this state in furtherance of the commission of an act of prostitution by the~~
13 ~~person agreeing to engage in that act. As used in this subdivision, "prostitution" includes~~
14 ~~any lewd act between persons for money or other consideration.~~

15 ~~(c)~~ (b) Who accosts other persons in any public place or in any place open to the
16 public for the purpose of begging or soliciting alms.

17 ~~(d)~~ (c) Who loiters in or about any toilet open to the public for the purpose of
18 engaging in or soliciting any lewd or lascivious or any unlawful act.

19 ~~(e)~~ (d) Who loiters or wanders upon the streets or from place to place without
20 apparent reason or business and who refuses to identify himself or herself and to account for
21 his or her presence when requested by any peace officer so to do, if the surrounding
22 circumstances would indicate to a reasonable person that the public safety demands this
23 identification.

24 ~~(f)~~ (e) Who is found in any public place under the influence of intoxicating liquor,
25 any drug, controlled substance, toluene, or any combination of any intoxicating liquor, drug,
26 controlled substance, or toluene, in a condition that he or she is unable to exercise care for
27 his or her own safety or the safety of others, or by reason of his or her being under the
28 influence of intoxicating liquor, any drug, controlled substance, toluene, or any combination
29 of any intoxicating liquor, drug, or toluene, interferes with or obstructs or prevents the free
30 use of any street, sidewalk, or other public way.

31 ~~(g)~~ (f) When a person has violated subdivision (f), a peace officer, if he or she is
32 reasonably able to do so, shall place the person, or cause him or her to be placed, in civil
33 protective custody. The person shall be taken to a facility, designated pursuant to Section
34 5170 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, for the 72-hour treatment and evaluation of
35 inebriates.

36

37 §647f

38 ~~In any accusatory pleading charging a violation of subdivision (b) of Section 647, if~~
39 ~~the defendant has been previously convicted one or more times of a violation of that~~
40 ~~subdivision or of any other offense listed in subdivision (d) of Section 1202.1, and in~~
41 ~~connection with one or more of those convictions a blood test was administered pursuant to~~
42 ~~Section 1202.1 or 1202.6 with positive test results, of which the defendant was informed, the~~
43 ~~previous conviction and positive blood test results, of which the defendant was informed,~~
44 ~~shall be charged in the accusatory pleading. If the previous conviction and informed test~~
45 ~~results are found to be true by the trier of fact or are admitted by the defendant, the~~
46 ~~defendant is guilty of a felony.~~

47
48 §647.1

49 In addition to any fine assessed under Section 647, the judge may assess a fine not to
50 exceed seventy dollars (\$70) against any person who violates subdivision (a) ~~or (b)~~ of
51 Section 647, or, if the offense involves intravenous use of a controlled substance,
52 subdivision (f) of Section 647, with the proceeds of this fine to be used in accordance with
53 Section 1463.23.

54 The court shall, however, take into consideration the defendant's ability to pay and
55 no defendant shall be denied probation because of his or her inability to pay the fine
56 permitted under this section.

57
58 §315.

59 ~~Every person who keeps a house of ill fame in this state, resorted to for the purposes~~
60 ~~of prostitution or lewdness, or who willfully resides in such house, is guilty of a~~
61 ~~misdemeanor; and in all prosecutions for keeping or resorting to such a house common~~
62 ~~repute may be received as competent evidence of the character of the house, the purpose for~~
63 ~~which it is kept or used, and the character of the women inhabiting or resorting to it.~~

64
65 §316

66 ~~Every person who keeps any disorderly house, or any house for the purpose of~~
67 ~~assignation or prostitution, or any house of public resort, by which the peace, comfort, or~~
68 ~~decency of the immediate neighborhood is habitually disturbed, or who keeps any inn in a~~
69 ~~disorderly manner; and every person who lets any apartment or tenement, knowing that it is~~
70 ~~to be used for the purpose of assignation or prostitution, is guilty of a misdemeanor.~~

71
72 §318

73 Whoever, through invitation or device, prevails upon any person to visit any room,
74 building, or other places kept for the purpose of illegal gambling ~~or prostitution~~, is guilty of
75 a misdemeanor, and, upon conviction thereof, shall be confined in the county jail not
76 exceeding six months, or fined not exceeding five hundred dollars (\$500), or be punished by
77 both that fine and imprisonment.

78
79 §266h

80 ~~(a) Except as provided in subdivision (b), any person who, knowing another person~~
81 ~~is a prostitute, lives or derives support or maintenance in whole or in part from the earnings~~

82 or proceeds of the person's prostitution, or from money loaned or advanced to or charged
83 against that person by any keeper or manager or inmate of a house or other place where
84 prostitution is practiced or allowed, or who solicits or receives compensation for soliciting
85 for the person, is guilty of pimping, a felony, and shall be punishable by imprisonment in the
86 state prison for three, four, or six years.

87 (b) Any person who, knowing another person is a prostitute, lives or derives support
88 or maintenance in whole or in part from the earnings or proceeds of the person's prostitution,
89 or from money loaned or advanced to or charged against that person by any keeper or
90 manager or inmate of a house or other place where prostitution is practiced or allowed, or
91 who solicits or receives compensation for soliciting for the person, when the prostitute is a
92 minor, is guilty of pimping a minor, a felony, and shall be punishable as follows:

93 (1) If the person engaged in prostitution is a minor over the age of 16 years, the
94 offense is punishable by imprisonment in the state prison for three, four, or six years.

95 (2) If the person engaged in prostitution is under 16 years of age, the offense is
96 punishable by imprisonment in the state prison for three, six, or eight years.

97
98 §266i

99 ~~(a) Except as provided in subdivision (b), Any person who does any of the following~~
100 ~~with a minor~~ is guilty of pandering, a felony, and shall be punishable by imprisonment in the
101 state prison for three, four, or six years:

102 (1) Procures another person for the purpose of prostitution.

103 (2) By promises, threats, violence, or by any device or scheme, causes, induces,
104 persuades or encourages another person to become a prostitute.

105 (3) Procures for another person a place as an inmate in a house of prostitution or as
106 an inmate of any place in which prostitution is encouraged or allowed within this state.

107 (4) By promises, threats, violence or by any device or scheme, causes, induces,
108 persuades or encourages an inmate of a house of prostitution, or any other place in which
109 prostitution is encouraged or allowed, to remain therein as an inmate.

110 (5) By fraud or artifice, or by duress of person or goods, or by abuse of any position
111 of confidence or authority, procures another person for the purpose of prostitution, or to
112 enter any place in which prostitution is encouraged or allowed within this state, or to come
113 into this state or leave this state for the purpose of prostitution.

114 (6) Receives or gives, or agrees to receive or give, any money or thing of value for
115 procuring, or attempting to procure, another person for the purpose of prostitution, or to
116 come into this state or leave this state for the purpose of prostitution.

117 (7) Derives or receives support from prostitution.

118 (b) Any person who does any of the acts described in subdivision (a) ~~with another~~
119 ~~person who is a minor~~ is guilty of pandering, a felony, and shall be punishable as follows:

120 (1) If the other person is a minor over the age of 16 years, the offense is punishable
121 by imprisonment in the state prison for three, four, or six years.

122 (2) If the other person is under 16 years of age, the offense is punishable by
123 imprisonment in the state prison for three, six, or eight years.

124
125 §11225.

126 (a) Every building or place used for the purpose of illegal gambling as defined by
127 state law or local ordinance, ~~lewdness, assignation, or prostitution~~, and every building or
128 place in or upon which acts of illegal gambling as defined by state law or local ordinance,
129 ~~lewdness, assignation, or prostitution~~, are held or occur, is a nuisance which shall be
130 enjoined, abated, and prevented, and for which damages may be recovered, whether it is a
131 public or private nuisance.

132 Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed to apply the definition of a nuisance to
133 a private residence where illegal gambling is conducted on an intermittent basis and without
134 the purpose of producing profit for the owner or occupier of the premises.

135 (b) Every building or place used as a bathhouse which as a primary activity
136 encourages or permits conduct that according to the guidelines of the federal Centers for
137 Disease Control can transmit AIDS, including, but not limited to, anal intercourse, oral
138 copulation, or vaginal intercourse, is a nuisance which shall be enjoined, abated, and
139 prevented, and for which damages may be recovered, whether it is a public or private
140 nuisance.

141 For purposes of this subdivision, a "bathhouse" means a business which, as its
142 primary purpose, provides facilities for a spa, whirlpool, communal bath, sauna, steam bath,
143 mineral bath, mud bath, or facilities for swimming.

144
145 §653.20.

146 For purposes of this chapter, the following definitions apply:

147 (a) ~~"Commit prostitution" means to engage in sexual conduct for money or other~~
148 ~~consideration, but does not include sexual conduct engaged in as a part of any stage~~
149 ~~performance, play, or other entertainment open to the public.~~

150 (b) ~~"Public place" means an area open to the public, or an alley, plaza, park,~~
151 ~~driveway, or parking lot, or an automobile, whether moving or not, or a building open to the~~
152 ~~general public, including one which serves food or drink, or provides entertainment, or the~~
153 ~~doorways and entrances to a building or dwelling, or the grounds enclosing a building or~~
154 ~~dwelling.~~

155 (c) ~~"Loiter" means to delay or linger without a lawful purpose for being on the~~
156 ~~property and for the purpose of committing a crime as opportunity may be discovered.~~

157
158 §653.22.

159 (a) ~~It is unlawful for any person to loiter in any public place with the intent to~~
160 ~~commit prostitution. This intent is evidenced by acting in a manner and under~~
161 ~~circumstances which openly demonstrate the purpose of inducing, enticing, or soliciting~~
162 ~~prostitution, or procuring another to commit prostitution.~~

163 (b) ~~Among the circumstances that may be considered in determining whether a~~
164 ~~person loiters with the intent to commit prostitution are that the person:~~

165 (1) ~~Repeatedly beckons to, stops, engages in conversations with, or attempts to stop~~
166 ~~or engage in conversations with passersby, indicative of soliciting for prostitution.~~

167 (2) ~~Repeatedly stops or attempts to stop motor vehicles by hailing the drivers,~~
168 ~~waving arms, or making any other bodily gestures, or engages or attempts to engage the~~

169 drivers or passengers of the motor vehicles in conversation, indicative of soliciting for
170 prostitution.

171 (3) Has been convicted of violating this section, subdivision (a) or (b) of Section
172 647, or any other offense relating to or involving prostitution, within five years of the arrest
173 under this section.

174 (4) Circles an area in a motor vehicle and repeatedly beckons to, contacts, or
175 attempts to contact or stop pedestrians or other motorists, indicative of soliciting for
176 prostitution.

177 (5) Has engaged, within six months prior to the arrest under this section, in any
178 behavior described in this subdivision, with the exception of paragraph (3), or in any other
179 behavior indicative of prostitution activity.

180 (e) The list of circumstances set forth in subdivision (b) is not exclusive. The
181 circumstances set forth in subdivision (b) should be considered particularly salient if they
182 occur in an area that is known for prostitution activity. Any other relevant circumstances
183 may be considered in determining whether a person has the requisite intent. Moreover, no
184 one circumstance or combination of circumstances is in itself determinative of intent. Intent
185 must be determined based on an evaluation of the particular circumstances of each case.

186
187 §653.23.

188 (a) It is unlawful for any person to do either of the following:

189 (1) Direct, supervise, recruit, or otherwise aid another person in the commission of a
190 violation of subdivision (b) of Section 647 or subdivision (a) of Section 653.22.

191 (2) Collect or receive all or part of the proceeds earned from an act or acts of
192 prostitution committed by another person in violation of subdivision (b) of Section 647.

193 (b) Among the circumstances that may be considered in determining whether a
194 person is in violation of subdivision (a) are that the person does the following:

195 (1) Repeatedly speaks or communicates with another person who is acting in
196 violation of subdivision (a) of Section 653.22.

197 (2) Repeatedly or continuously monitors or watches another person who is acting in
198 violation of subdivision (a) of Section 653.22.

199 (3) Repeatedly engages or attempts to engage in conversation with pedestrians or
200 motorists to solicit, arrange, or facilitate an act of prostitution between the pedestrians or
201 motorists and another person who is acting in violation of subdivision (a) of Section 653.22.

202 (4) Repeatedly stops or attempts to stop pedestrians or motorists to solicit, arrange,
203 or facilitate an act of prostitution between pedestrians or motorists and another person who
204 is acting in violation of subdivision (a) of Section 653.22.

205 (5) Circles an area in a motor vehicle and repeatedly beckons to, contacts, or
206 attempts to contact or stop pedestrians or other motorists to solicit, arrange, or facilitate an
207 act of prostitution between the pedestrians or motorists and another person who is acting in
208 violation of subdivision (a) of Section 653.22.

209 (6) Receives or appears to receive money from another person who is acting in
210 violation of subdivision (a) of Section 653.22.

211 (7) Engages in any of the behavior described in paragraphs (1) to (6), inclusive, in
212 regard to or on behalf of two or more persons who are in violation of subdivision (a) of
213 Section 653.22.

214 (8) Has been convicted of violating this section, subdivision (a) or (b) of Section
215 647, subdivision (a) of Section 653.22, Section 266h, or 266i, or any other offense relating
216 to or involving prostitution within five years of the arrest under this section.

217 (9) Has engaged, within six months prior to the arrest under subdivision (a), in any
218 behavior described in this subdivision, with the exception of paragraph (8), or in any other
219 behavior indicative of prostitution activity.

220 (e) The list of circumstances set forth in subdivision (b) is not exclusive. The
221 circumstances set forth in subdivision (b) should be considered particularly salient if they
222 occur in an area that is known for prostitution activity. Any other relevant circumstances
223 may be considered. Moreover, no one circumstance or combination of circumstances is in
224 itself determinative. A violation of subdivision (a) shall be determined based on an
225 evaluation of the particular circumstances of each case.

226 (d) Nothing in this section shall preclude the prosecution of a suspect for a violation
227 of Section 266h or 266i or for any other offense, or for a violation of this section in
228 conjunction with a violation of Section 266h or 266i or any other offense.

229
230 §653.24

231 If any section, subdivision, sentence, clause, phrase, or portion of this chapter is for
232 any reason held invalid or unconstitutional by any court of competent jurisdiction, that
233 portion shall be deemed a separate, distinct, and independent provision, and that holding
234 shall not affect the validity of the remaining portion of the chapter.

235
236 §429.13

237 Operators of Businesses of Prostitution must adopt and promote safer sex practices –

238 (1) Every operator of a business of prostitution must –

239 (a) Take all reasonable steps to give health information (whether oral or written) to
240 sex workers and clients; and

241 (b) If the person operates a brothel, display health information prominently in that
242 brothel; and

243 (c) Not state or imply that a medical examination of a sex worker means the sex
244 worker is not infected, or likely to be infected, with a sexually transmissible infection; and

245 (d) The owner and operator of a businesses of prostitution must not discourage the
246 use of prophylactics in the course of the business.

247 (2) The obligations in this section apply only in relation to commercial sexual
248 services provided for the business and to sex workers and clients in connection with those
249 services.

250 (3) In this section, health information means information on safer sex practices and
251 on services for the prevention and treatment of sexually transmissible infections.

252 (4) The director of the Health Services Department may implement suitable
253 regulations to enforce the above.

(Proposed new language underlined; language to be deleted stricken)

PROPONENT: Bar Association of San Francisco

STATEMENT OF REASONS:

Existing Law: Current law makes providing sexual services a crime. It is also a crime to maintain a place where sexual services are provided (disorderly house), and to derive income from one who provides sexual services.

This Resolution: Removes penal provisions for consensual sex acts, whether they are without financial compensation, or for financial compensation. This resolution retains intact all of the laws prohibiting any form of forced prostitution. It also retains intact all of the laws protecting children from prostitution.

The Problem: People have bought and sold sexual services throughout history. Historically, prostitution has been regulated and criminalized in keeping with varying moral perspectives. Current condemnation and criminal prohibitions have not abated the prostitution, but rather, have been harmful to sex workers and to the general public as prostitution is driven underground. The underground nature of the prostitution business creates dangers and vulnerabilities for sex workers and their clients and negatively impacts public health and safety. This illegal status makes it easier for predators to commit acts of violence against prostitutes including human trafficking. Prohibitions make regulation impossible.

By bringing sex work into daylight, we will:

1. Reduce violence. Legal sex work creates environments in which oversight is possible which protects prostitutes and clients from violence including rape, robbery, battery, extortion, etc.
2. Reduce trafficking in human beings in the sex trade. This measure will provide a lawful environment for the sexual service industry, shifting enforcement resources to actual incidences of abuse rather than consensual commercial sex in general.
3. Promote public health. Current research reflects that prostitutes have a rate of sexually transmitted disease infections that is equal to other comparable segments of the population. Openness in the sex industry will support sexual health educational initiatives including safe sex practices and access to medical services for sex workers.
4. Promote labor rights and OSHA standards in the sex industry. Workers in the sex industry deserve the same rights as workers in any other trade, including the right to legal protection from crimes such as on the job harassment, as well as wage and hour laws. Legal sex industry businesses can be regulated as are other industries applying OSHA and other standard business regulations.

5. Promote positive community relations. A legal sex industry provides support for community feedback addressing issues of zoning, traffic, advertising and public health.

This section retains Penal Code Sections 266, 266 a, 2666 e, and 266 f. These sections punish procurement of minors, procurement by force or fraud, acquiring a prostitute, and selling a prostitute. The penalties for these offenses remain quite severe.

The prohibition of pimping a minor has been transferred from Penal Code Section 266 h to Penal Code Section 266 i. It carries a punishment of between three and eight years.

This proposal also enacts Health and Safety Code Section 429.13, allowing for enforcement of safe sex practices in the business of prostitution.

This resolution incorporates legislation which has been enacted in New Zealand with positive experience.

IMPACT STATEMENT:

Civil Code Sections 798.56(c)(1) and 799.70(d) provide remedies to a landlord if a resident is convicted of prostitution. These will have to be addressed, but the social impact aspects can be dealt with as zoning issues.

AUTHOR AND PERMANENT CONTACT: David Michael Bigeleisen, 101 Howard Street, Suite 310, San Francisco, CA 94105, (415) 957-1717, bigelaw@ix.netcom.com; Margaret Grover, Haight Brown & Bonesteel LLP, 71 Stevenson Street, 20th Floor, San Francisco, CA 94105, (415) 546-7500, mgrover@hbblaw.com

RESPONSIBLE FLOOR DELEGATE: David Michael Bigeleisen